

TO: **COUNCIL ASSESSMENT PANEL**  
 DATE: **19 DECEMBER 2018**  
 SUBJECT: **COUNCIL ASSESSMENT REPORT**  
 AUTHOR: **DEAN SPASIC**  
**DEVELOPMENT OFFICER PLANNING**

ATTACHMENTS: **1. LOCALITY PLAN**  
**2. PROPOSAL PLANS**  
**3. REPRESENTATIONS**  
**4. APPLICANT'S RESPONSE TO REPRESENTATIONS**  
**5. DPTI REPORT**  
**6. TRAFFIC REPORT**

HEARING OF REPRESENTORS: **J KELLY AND G VECCHIO**  
 HEARING OF APPLICANT: **R MOUVERI ON BEHALF OF APPLICANT**

---

DA NO.	:	<u>110/00502/18</u>
APPLICANT	:	<u>CITY OF HOLDFAST BAY</u>
LOCATION	:	<u>410-420 BRIGHTON ROAD, HOVE</u>
DEVELOPMENT PLAN	:	<u>2 JUNE 2016</u>
ZONE AND POLICY AREA	:	<u>COMMUNITY ZONE - RECREATION POLICY AREA 1</u>
NATURE OF DEVELOPMENT:		<u>MERIT</u>
PROPOSAL	:	<u>DEMOLITION OF THREE EXISTING SPORTING CLUBROOM BUILDINGS AND CONSTRUCTION OF THREE REPLACEMENT SPORTING CLUBROOM BUILDINGS, AND REMOVAL OF ONE REGULATED TREE</u>
EXISTING USE	:	<u>SPORTING CLUBROOMS AND PLAYING FIELDS</u>
REFERRALS	:	<u>DPTI</u>
CATEGORY	:	<u>TWO</u>
REPRESENTATIONS	:	<u>TWO</u>
RECOMMENDATION	:	<u>DEVELOPMENT PLAN CONSENT – SUBJECT TO CONDITIONS</u>

## 1. Site and Locality

The subject site is located on the eastern side of Brighton Road, 160 metres south of the Adelaide-Seafood rail corridor. The site has an irregular shape with a frontage to Brighton Road of 145 metres, a frontage to Stopford Road to the north of 235 metres, a frontage to Highet Avenue to the south of 400 metres, with a total area of approximately 70,000m<sup>2</sup>. The site represents the single largest sporting complex in Holdfast Bay. The site has an interface with the side and rear of twelve residential properties to the north and east. The site is occupied by three sporting clubs (Brighton Rugby Club, Brighton Football/Cricket Club and Brighton Lacrosse Club) each with a designated playing field and separate clubrooms.

The locality comprises a mix of residential, recreational, community and commercial uses. Within the District Centre Zone and Neighbourhood Centre Zone on the opposite side of Brighton Road to the west, and to the immediate north and south are mainly specialty shops, consulting rooms and offices. Predominantly to the north, south and east is the Residential Zone, characterised mainly by

detached single-storey dwellings, with sporadic examples of newer infill development, and also some existing accommodation for the aged.

*Refer to Attachment 1*

## 2. Background

At its meeting held on 28 June 2016, Council resolved to endorse a masterplan for the redevelopment of Brighton Oval following extensive community consultation, including with the three sporting bodies that share the facility. The need for a masterplan to guide the redevelopment of the complex was essential, as it would ensure a coordinated and strategic approach to the provision of recreation infrastructure on the site. This also ensured that any subsequent development application could be prepared and assessed as a single proposal where synergies between carparking, traffic movements, and architecture would be enabled. The complex is a major metropolitan sporting facility and has strong linkages to the sports fields of Brighton Primary School (immediately opposite the complex to the south) as well as links with smaller sport facilities within the precinct.

Prior to commencing the assessment process, Council formally wrote to the Minister for Planning inviting him to appoint the State Commission Assessment Panel (SCAP) as the relevant planning authority due to the potential for a perceived conflict of interest should Council's Assessment Panel (CAP) assess the proposal, given that Council is both landlord and proponent for the development. The Minister formally advised Council that he was of the view that the CAP should assess the proposal, as any perceived conflicts could be managed.

## 3. Proposed Development

The development comprises the demolition of three existing sporting clubrooms and their replacement with three larger, two-storey sporting clubrooms. The proposal also seeks to increase the car parking available on the site from 276 to 344 formal spaces. The table below summarises the existing and proposed floor areas, and the parking demand generated by each new building.

Building	Existing Total Floor Area	Proposed Total Floor Area	Increase	Required Parking (@1 space per 10m <sup>2</sup> of total floor area)	Parking Provided
Football/Cricket	732m <sup>2</sup>	1006m <sup>2</sup>	274m <sup>2</sup>	101	
Rugby	469m <sup>2</sup>	972m <sup>2</sup>	503m <sup>2</sup>	97	
Lacrosse	359m <sup>2</sup>	770m <sup>2</sup>	411m <sup>2</sup>	77	
<b>TOTAL</b>	1,560m <sup>2</sup>	2,748m <sup>2</sup>	1,188m <sup>2</sup>	<b>275</b>	<b>344</b>

The proposal also seeks the removal of one Regulated tree ('Willow Myrtle), which has been assessed to be in poor health and structure, with a limited life expectancy.

There is no change of land use proposed with this proposal, and there are no historic conditions of approval that encumber the hours of operation or maximum number of persons allowed to use the sporting complex and its clubrooms. Whilst the new buildings are designed to cater for existing members, it is anticipated that the overall patronage may increase by up to 10% compared with current participants and spectators, and traffic assessments have been based on this assumption.

With respect to the siting of the new buildings, the Rugby building will be setback 5 metres from Brighton Road, 62 metres to Highet Avenue, and 60 metres to the northern boundary shared with commercial and residential properties. The building has a maximum height of 8.5 metres to the mechanical plant screen. The Football/Cricket building is setback 125 metres from Brighton Road, 83 metres to Highet Avenue, and 80 metres from Stopford Road, and 37 metres from the shared boundary with the aged care housing to the north-west. The building has a maximum height of 8 metres to the mechanical plant screen. The lacrosse building is setback 5 metres from Highet Avenue, 257 metres from Brighton Road, 152 metres from Stopford Road, and 110 metres from the shared boundary with residential properties to the east.

Each of the buildings comprise a shared architectural styling, accentuated by asymmetrical butterfly roofs, and similar mix of materials including aluminium framed windows and doors, glazed balustrades with stainless steel handrails, colorbond cladding and roof sheeting, textures precast walls, fibre cement sheet banding, feature hardwood timber slats, using a combination of colours including mid-greys, natural timber, and charcoal. The roofs will also feature solar panels recycled from the existing buildings.

Although there will be separate facilities for each of the clubs, these facilities will be multi-use and will be able to be used by community groups when not in use by the clubs.

The indicative 'scoreboard' shown in the attachments does not form part of this development application and is required to form part of a separate development application at a later stage.

*Refer to Attachment 2*

#### **4. Public Consultation**

The application was subject to a Category 2 public notification. Two representations were received during the consultation period. They are summarised as follows:

GE Vecchio and JG Kelly - 11 Highet Avenue, Hove

- Noise emanating from the buildings through their use for functions.
- Retention and planting of trees as a means to curtail noise emissions.
- Traffic management along Highet Avenue.

E and K Lok - 2 Highet Avenue, Hove

- Overlooking from the balcony of the new Lacrosse Club building into adjacent residential properties.

*Refer to Attachment 3*

The applicant has provided a response to each of the issues raised. A revised traffic assessment was undertaken also. Briefly, the applicant advises that:

- An independent Acoustic Engineering contractor (Sonus) has been engaged to prepare a noise emissions reduction strategy to ensure that noise from the buildings does not affect nearby residents.
- The majority of trees will be retained on the site, with new tree plantings proposed for the southern side of the Football/Cricket building as indicated on the preliminary tree planting plan.

- The inclusion of sufficient and increased on-site car parking, coupled with the minimal change to participation numbers, should not cause any greater impact to traffic and parking along Hight Street.
- The Lacrosse Club Building is located 110 metres from the shared boundary with the representor's property to the east. This distance, coupled with the existing trees located along the fenceline, will be sufficient to negate any direct views into the neighbouring properties from the vantage point of persons standing on the balcony of the Lacrosse Club building.

Outcomes of representations and responses:

- A condition of approval has been recommended to ensure that should the development receive approval, that noise attenuation measures are incorporated into the design of each building at the time of detailed design to satisfy the noise emissions reduction strategy prepared by Sonus and forming part of the application. This is also beneficial for the Rugby building, in particular, which is located adjacent Brighton Road and will benefit from acoustic measures that abate outside traffic noise. Also, a second condition of approval will require that the doors leading to external balconies are closed for access from the hours between 10:00pm to 8:00am on all days, with the exception of any requirements for maintenance (i.e. cleaning).
- There are presently 95 trees located on the site, 15 of which are Regulated, only one of which will be removed due to poor health. The proposal seeks to remove up to 15 non-regulated trees due to poor health, and plant 72 new trees (species to be determined by detailed landscaping plan).
- The preliminary tree planting plan show the indicative location of future plantings, however a condition of approval has been recommended to ensure that should the development receive approval that a detailed landscaping plan is provided for further assessment.
- Council has commissioned an independent traffic report that shows minimal impact from the development relative to current conditions. Whilst sufficient on-site car parking has been provided, vehicles will continue to rely on Hight Avenue for access and some parking.
- The significant distance between the proposed Lacrosse Club building's eastern balcony and the shared boundary with representor's property to the east does not warrant any further mitigating measures such as screens to the balcony or raised boundary fencing.

*Refer to Attachment 4*

## **5 DPTI Referral**

In its report to council, DPTI advised that it is prepared to permit the development to proceed without further modifications. Conditions recommended by DPTI form part of the recommendation.

*Refer to Attachment 5*

## **6. Traffic Report**

The traffic engineer commissioned by council to assess the traffic and parking implications of the proposal advises that:

- Additional parking provision would satisfactorily cater for the future parking demands of the overall site.
- The parking provision of 344 spaces would significantly exceed usage requirement. Indeed, the future parking provision of 344 spaces would cater for an equivalent scenario of a 30% increase in usage at the oval and facilities (a 10% increase in usage is anticipated).

- The proposed parking provision would be able to satisfy the likely future peak parking demands at the oval.
- The proposed parking layouts would seem to comply with the parking standard. Some adjustments to the design is recommended, which would enable more parking to be accommodated on-site and to provide better circulation around the various parking areas.
- With respect to the traffic related matters, some of these concerns could be addressed by traffic management measures within the site (for example using gates or other restrictive devices to discourage hoon behaviour inside the oval) and traffic management measures in the adjacent streets.
- Approximately two thirds of all the parking spaces at the oval in the future would now be accessible only from Stopford Road (left and right turn in from Brighton Road) or via a left turn from Brighton Road (rugby field northern car park). Such traffic movement patterns would reduce the use of Highet Avenue for entry to the Oval, compared to the current situation. In this regard, the demand for the right turn in from Brighton Road into Highet Avenue would likely be reduced as a consequence.

*Refer to Attachment 6*

**7. HOLDFAST BAY (CITY) DEVELOPMENT PLAN - ASSESSMENT - NON RESIDENTIAL DEVELOPMENT - COUNCIL WIDE - PRINCIPLES OF DEVELOPMENT CONTROL**

<b>Community Facilities</b>	
1. Location of community facilities including social, health, welfare, education and <u>recreation</u> facilities where they are conveniently accessible to the population they serve.	Complies. The site is centrally located adjacent a main road and close to major public transport corridor.
2. Community facilities should be <u>integrated in their design</u> to promote efficient land use.	Complies. The proposal represents an integrated and coordinated redevelopment of the whole of Brighton Oval and its facilities.
3. Design of community facilities should encourage flexible and adaptable use of open space and facilities for a range of uses over time.	Complies. Each clubroom has been designed for adaptability for use by the community generally.
<b>Crime Prevention</b>	
1. Development should be designed to maximise surveillance of public spaces through the incorporation of clear lines of sight, appropriate lighting and the use of visible permeable barriers wherever practicable.	Complies. Large glass openings and wide balconies have been incorporated into the design of each clubroom to maximise clear lines of sight.
2. Buildings should be designed to overlook public and communal streets and public open space to allow casual surveillance.	Complies. Large glass openings and wide balconies have been incorporated into the design of each clubroom to maximise surveillance.
3. Development should provide a robust environment that is resistant to vandalism and graffiti.	Complies. Each of the buildings are comprised of materials that are readily cleanable and repairable. Security cameras and lighting will be incorporated separately by council to deter vandalism.

<b>Design and Appearance</b>	
1. The design of a building may be of a contemporary nature and exhibit an innovative style provided the overall form is sympathetic to the scale of development in the locality and with the context of its setting with regard to shape, size, materials and colour.	Complies. The buildings are of a contemporary design with a mix of materials and finishes that will add visual interest.
2. Where a building is sited on or close to a side boundary, the side boundary wall should be sited and limited in length and height to minimise: (a) the visual impact of the building as viewed from adjoining properties (b) overshadowing of adjoining properties and allow adequate sun light to neighbouring buildings.	While high walls of approximately 8 metres are located adjacent to Hightet Avenue (Lacrosse building) and Brighton Road (Rugby building), each building is complemented by landscaping, surrounded by a broad curtilage, and sited clear of other land and structures so as not to appear as overbearing.
5. Building form should not unreasonably restrict existing views available from neighbouring properties and public spaces. 9. Development on land adjacent to a State or local heritage place, as listed in Table HoB/5-State Heritage Places or in Table HoB/4-Local Heritage Places, should be sited and designed to reinforce the historic character of the place and maintain its visual prominence.	Complies. The only building that is located in the line-of-sight of a residential property is the Lacrosse building, which is located in the same location as the one it proposes to replace. This building is not a new incursion and does not restrict existing views.  Complies. The Local Heritage listed row of Stone Pine Trees located along on the site along the boundary with Stopford Road, will not be affected by the development.
10. The design and location of buildings should enable direct winter sunlight into adjacent dwellings and private open space and minimise the overshadowing of: (a) windows of habitable rooms (b) upper-level private balconies that provide the primary open space area for a dwelling (c) solar collectors (such as solar hot water systems and photovoltaic cells).	Complies. Each of the proposed buildings are set well clear of adjoining properties.
11. Development should minimise direct overlooking of habitable rooms and private open spaces of dwellings through measures such as: (a) off-setting the location of balconies and windows of habitable rooms with those of other buildings so that views are oblique rather than direct (b) building setbacks from boundaries (including building boundary to boundary where appropriate) that interrupt views or that provide a spatial separation between balconies or windows of habitable rooms (c) screening devices (including fencing, obscure glazing, screens, external ventilation blinds, window hoods and shutters) that are integrated into the building design and have minimal negative effect on residents' or neighbours' amenity.	Complies. Each of the proposed viewing balconies are set well clear of adjoining properties. The balcony associated with the Lacrosse Club overlooks presidential properties to the east, although the separation distance is 110 metres. There is no direct overlooking, but a condition of approval requiring further vegetation along the boundary may be warranted to remove any possibility of overlooking.
15. Buildings should be designed and sited to avoid creating extensive areas of uninterrupted walling facing areas exposed to public view.	Complies. Each elevation is articulated to some degree by expressed jointing and use of materials.
16. Building design should emphasise pedestrian entry points to provide perceptible and direct access from public street frontages and vehicle parking areas.	Complies.
17. Outdoor lighting should not result in light spillage on adjacent land.	Complies. Although lighting does not form part of the proposal, future security lighting of each building will be directional and not spill.

<b>Design and Appearance (Cont)</b>	
19. In mixed use areas, development facing the street should be designed to activate the street frontage(s): (a) including features that attract people to the locality such as frequent doors and display windows, retail shopfronts and/or outdoor eating or dining areas (b) minimising the frontage for fire escapes, service doors, plant and equipment hatches (c) avoiding undercroft or ground floor vehicle parking that is visible from the primary street frontage (d) using colour, vertical and horizontal elements, roof overhangs and other design techniques to provide visual interest and reduced massing.	Complies. The street elevations are well articulated comprising a mix of materials, projecting fins, substantial screening of the car park and particularly on the main Brighton Road and Highet Avenue frontages.
21. Outdoor storage, loading and service areas should be: (a) screened from public view by a combination of built form, solid fencing and/or landscaping (b) conveniently located and designed to enable the manoeuvring of service and delivery vehicles (c) sited away from sensitive land uses.	A condition of approval will be imposed to manage this issue.
23. All setbacks from the road frontage should be additional to the road widening setback established under the <i>Metropolitan Adelaide Road Widening Plan Act 1972</i> .	No road widening indicated by DPTI.
<b>Energy Efficiency</b>	
1. Development should provide for efficient solar access to buildings and open space all year around.	Complies. Extensive use of glass in the architecture of each building will ensure maximum natural light.
2. Buildings should be sited and designed: (a) to ensure adequate natural light and winter sunlight is available to the main activity areas of adjacent buildings (b) so that open spaces associated with the main activity areas face north for exposure to winter sun (c) to promote energy conservation by maintaining adequate access to winter sunlight to the main ground level of living areas of existing dwellings on adjoining land.	Complies. Extensive use of glass in the architecture of each building will ensure maximum natural light. Broad canopies ensure adequate shade.
<b>Energy Efficiency</b>	
4. Development should facilitate the efficient use of photovoltaic cells and solar hot water systems by: (a) taking into account overshadowing from neighbouring buildings (b) designing roof orientation and pitches to maximise exposure to direct sunlight.	Roof design includes the use of solar panels recycled from the existing buildings.
<b>Hazards</b>	
1. Development should be excluded from areas that are vulnerable to, and cannot be adequately and effectively protected from, the risk of hazards.	Complies.
4. Development should not occur on land where the risk of flooding is likely to be harmful to safety or damage property.	Complies.
<b>Heritage Places</b>	
11. The development of local heritage places which are public open spaces should conserve, respect, complement and reinstate where appropriate the particular built and landscape characteristics which establish the historic significance of the relevant place.	Complies. . The Local Heritage listed row of Stone Pine Trees located along on the site along the boundary with Stopford Road, will not be affected by the development.

<b>Interface between Land Uses</b>	
<p>1. Development should not detrimentally affect the amenity of the locality or cause unreasonable interference through any of the following:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) the emission of effluent, odour, smoke, fumes, dust or other airborne pollutants</li> <li>(b) noise</li> <li>(c) vibration</li> <li>(d) electrical interference</li> <li>(e) light spill</li> <li>(f) glare</li> <li>(g) hours of operation</li> <li>(h) traffic impacts.</li> </ul>	Complies. The Sonus noise reduction strategy outlines requirements for compliance with relevant EPA guidelines. A more comprehensive assessment will be required as a condition of approval.
<p>2. Development should be sited and designed to minimise negative impact on existing and potential future land uses considered appropriate in the locality.</p>	Complies. Acoustic measures will be required as a condition of approval to abate noise emissions and also manage noise intrusion.
<p>3. Development adjacent to a <b>Residential Zone</b> should be designed to minimise overlooking and overshadowing of nearby residential properties.</p>	Complies.
<p>5. Sensitive uses likely to conflict with the continuation of lawfully existing developments and land uses considered appropriate for the zone should not be developed or should be designed to minimise negative impacts.</p>	The development is an anticipated use within the Community Zone and will reasonably minimise impacts on adjoining residential properties.
<p>6. Non-residential development on land abutting a residential zone should be designed to minimise noise impacts to achieve adequate levels of compatibility between existing and proposed uses.</p>	Complies. See above.
<p>7. Development that emits noise (other than music noise) should include noise attenuation measures that achieve the relevant <i>Environment Protection (Noise) Policy</i> criteria when assessed at the nearest existing noise sensitive premises.</p>	Complies. Acoustic measures will be required as a condition of approval to abate noise emissions and also manage noise intrusion.
<b>Landscaping, Fences and Walls</b>	
<p>1. Development should incorporate open space and landscaping and minimise hard paved surfaces in order to:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>(a) complement built form and reduce the visual impact of larger buildings (eg taller and broader plantings against taller and bulkier building components)</li> <li>(b) enhance the appearance of road frontages</li> <li>(c) screen service yards, loading areas and outdoor storage areas</li> <li>(d) minimise maintenance and watering requirements</li> <li>(e) enhance and define outdoor spaces, including car parking areas</li> <li>(f) maximise shade and shelter</li> <li>(g) assist in climate control within and around buildings</li> <li>(h) minimise heat absorption and reflection</li> <li>(i) <u>maintain privacy</u></li> <li>(j) maximise stormwater re-use</li> <li>(k) complement existing vegetation, including native vegetation</li> <li>(l) contribute to the viability of ecosystems and species</li> <li>(m) promote water and biodiversity conservation</li> <li>(n) establish buffers to adjacent development and areas.</li> </ul>	Complies. New landscaping within the car park and augmentation of landscaping along the perimeter will enhance the outlook from adjacent land.

<b>Landscaping, Fences and Walls (Cont)</b>	
<p>2. Landscaping should:</p> <p>(a) include mature vegetation, the planting of locally indigenous species where appropriate and species tolerant of salt-laden winds near the coast</p> <p>(b) be oriented towards the street frontage</p> <p>(c) result in the appropriate clearance from powerlines and other infrastructure being maintained.</p>	<p>Complies. Only one Regulated tree will be removed (assessed as not worthy of retention). Much of the existing mature vegetation will be retained and augmented by new mature plantings. There are presently 95 trees located on the site, 15 of which are Regulated, only one of which will be removed due to poor health. The proposal seeks to remove up to 15 non-regulated trees due to poor health, and plant 72 new trees (species to be determined by detailed landscaping plan).</p>
<p>3. Landscaping should not:</p> <p>(a) unreasonably restrict solar access to adjoining development</p> <p>(b) cause damage to buildings, paths and other landscaping from root invasion, soil disturbance or plant overcrowding</p> <p>(c) introduce pest plants</p> <p>(d) increase the risk of bushfire</p> <p>(e) remove opportunities for passive surveillance</p> <p>(f) increase leaf fall in watercourses</p> <p>(g) increase the risk of weed invasion</p> <p>(h) obscure driver sight lines</p> <p>(i) create a hazard for train or tram drivers by obscuring sight lines at crossovers.</p>	<p>Complies.</p>
<b>Orderly and Sustainable Development</b>	
<p>1. Development should not prejudice the development of a zone for its intended purpose.</p>	<p>Complies.</p>
<b>Transport and Access</b>	
<p>6. Development generating high levels of traffic, such as schools, shopping centres and other retail areas, and entertainment and sporting facilities should incorporate passenger pick-up and set-down areas. The design of such areas should minimise interference to existing traffic and give priority to pedestrians, cyclists and public and community transport users.</p>	<p>Complies. There is a designated passenger drop-off/pick-up passenger loading zone on Highet Avenue.</p>
<p>8. Development should provide safe and convenient access for all anticipated modes of transport.</p>	<p>Complies. All passenger vehicles are accommodated, in addition to an exclusive emergency vehicle access.</p>
<p>10. Driveway cross-overs affecting pedestrian footpaths should maintain the level of the footpath.</p>	<p>Complies.</p>
<p>11. Driveway crossovers should be separated and the number minimised to optimise the provision of on- street visitor parking (where on-street parking is appropriate).</p>	<p>Complies.</p>
<p>12. Development should be designed to discourage commercial and industrial vehicle movements through residential streets and adjacent other sensitive land uses.</p>	<p>Complies. The redevelopment anticipates passenger vehicle movements only. Existing maintenance of the Oval is undertaken without change by council vehicles at off-peak times.</p>
<p>14. Development should provide for the on-site loading, unloading and turning of all traffic likely to be generated.</p>	<p>Complies.</p>
<b>Cycling and Walking</b>	
<p>15. Development should ensure that a permeable street and path network is established that encourages walking and cycling through the provision of safe, convenient and attractive routes with connections to adjoining streets, paths, open spaces, schools, pedestrian crossing points on arterial roads, public and community transport stops and activity centres.</p>	<p>Complies.</p>
<p>20. Development should encourage and facilitate cycling as a mode of transport by incorporating end-of-journey facilities including:</p> <p>(a) showers, changing facilities and secure lockers</p> <p>(b) signage indicating the location of bicycle facilities</p> <p>(c) secure bicycle parking facilities.</p>	<p>Complies. All clubrooms have shower and locker facilities.</p>

<b>Cycling and Walking (Cont)</b>	
21. On-site secure bicycle parking facilities should be: (a) located in a prominent place (b) located at ground floor level (c) located undercover (d) located where surveillance is possible (e) well lit and well signed (f) close to well used entrances (g) accessible by cycling along a safe, well lit route.	Complies.
26. On-site parking and manoeuvring areas servicing development abutting arterial roads should be designed to enable all vehicles to enter and exit the site in a forward direction.	Complies.
31. The number of vehicle access points onto arterial roads shown on <i>Overlay Maps - Transport</i> should be minimised, and where possible access points should be: (a) limited to local roads (b) shared between developments.	Complies.
32. The number of access points for cyclists and pedestrians onto all adjoining roads should be maximised.	Complies.
34. Development with access from arterial roads or roads as shown on <i>Overlay Maps - Transport</i> should be sited to avoid the need for vehicles to reverse on to or from the road.	Complies.
37. Development should be sited and designed to provide convenient access for people with a disability.	Complies.
39. Parking for people with a disability should be located conveniently to major entrances and ramps and adequately signposted or identified as being for people with a disability only.	Complies.
40. Development should provide off-street vehicle parking and specifically marked disabled car parking places to meet anticipated demand in accordance with zone requirements or, if not specified by the zone, <i>Table HoB/1 - Off Street Vehicle Parking Requirements</i> (with resultant numerical figure rounded to the nearest whole number).	Complies – 10 spaces/100m <sup>2</sup> proposed requires 275 spaces (344 spaces provided).
41. Development should be consistent with Australian Standard AS: 2890 - Parking facilities.	Complies.
42. Vehicle parking areas should be sited and designed in a manner that will: (a) facilitate safe and convenient pedestrian linkages to the development and areas of significant activity or interest in the vicinity of the development (b) include safe pedestrian and bicycle linkages that complement the overall pedestrian and cycling network (c) not inhibit safe and convenient traffic circulation (d) result in minimal conflict between customer and service vehicles (e) avoid the necessity to use public roads when moving from one part of a parking area to another (f) minimise the number of vehicle access points onto public roads (g) avoid the need for vehicles to reverse onto public roads (h) where practical, provide the opportunity for shared use of car parking and integration of car parking areas with adjoining development to reduce the total extent of vehicle parking areas and the requirement for access points (i) not dominate the character and appearance of a site when viewed from public roads and spaces	Complies.  <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A wombat crossing on Hight Avenue is provided in addition to direct pedestrian access from both Brighton Road and Stopford Road.</li> <li>• Continuous bitumised north-south linkage from Stopford Road to Hight Avenue provided for cyclists.</li> <li>• Traffic circulation is formalised and in accordance with Australian Standards.</li> <li>• Continuous linkage to separate car parking areas negates the need to use the public road.</li> <li>• Minimal number of vehicle access points provided.</li> <li>• No need for vehicles to reverse onto public roads.</li> <li>• Integrated car park design provides the opportunity for shared use of car parking and integration of car parking areas.</li> <li>• The carpark will be screened by vegetation from both Stopford Road and Hight Avenue.</li> </ul>

<b>Cycling and Walking (Cont)</b>	
44. Vehicle parking areas that are likely to be used during non-daylight hours should provide floodlit entry and exit points and site lighting directed and shaded in a manner that will not cause nuisance to adjacent properties or users of the parking area.	Complies subject to appropriate condition.
45. Parking areas should be sealed or paved in order to minimise dust and mud nuisance.	Complies.
46. To assist with stormwater detention and reduce heat loads in summer, vehicle parking areas should include soft (living) landscaping.	Complies.
47. Vehicle parking areas should be line-marked to delineate parking bays, movement aisles and direction of traffic flow.	Complies.
<b>Waste</b>	
6. Development that involves the production and/or collection of waste and/or recyclable material should include designated collection and storage area(s) that are: (a) screened and separated from adjoining areas	A condition regarding waste storage is proposed as a means to screen such areas from view.

**HOLDFAST BAY (CITY) DEVELOPMENT PLAN – ASSESSMENT – COMMUNITY ZONE – OBJECTIVES AND PRINCIPLES OF DEVELOPMENT CONTROL**

<b>Objectives</b>	
1. A zone accommodating community, educational and recreational facilities for the general public's benefit.	Complies. The proposed use for recreation activities is consistent with Objective 1.
2. Development that is integrated in function and provides a coordinated base to promote efficient service delivery.	Complies. The coordinated redevelopment of the three sporting clubs that share the facility will ensure an integrated functionality with respect to building design and carparking.
3. Development that contributes to the desired character of the zone.	Complies. The redevelopment of the site for recreation purposes ensures its long-term retention of character.
<b>Desired Character</b>	
The zone caters for a range of community land-uses and public facilities including public recreation, community centres, sporting areas, passive landscaped spaces and cemeteries.	Complies. The proposal is contemporary in both design and functionality, enabling the adaptability that the current buildings and car parking layout lack.
<b>Principles of Development Control</b>	
1. The following forms of development are envisaged in the zone: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Community centre</li> <li>• Recreation Area</li> <li>• Recreation Centre</li> <li>• Reserve</li> </ul>	Complies. The development incorporates each of these uses.
<b>Objectives of Development Control (Recreation Policy Area 1)</b>	
1. A policy area accommodating sporting, entertainment, cultural and recreational activities and associated spectator and administrative facilities.	Complies. The development incorporates each of these uses.
2. Development of integrated recreational areas and facilities that accommodate a range of activities accessible to the community.	Complies.
3. Buildings, facilities and carparks located and designed to blend in with existing or additional trees, vegetation and landscaping.	Complies. The proposed development retains the majority of existing vegetation on the site. There are presently 95 trees located on the site, 15 of which are Regulated, only one of which will be removed due to poor health. The proposal seeks to remove up to 15 non-regulated trees due to poor health, and plant 72 new trees (species to be determined by detailed landscaping plan).

<b>Objectives of Development Control (Recreation Policy Area 1)</b>	
<p>4. Development that contributes to the desired character of the policy area: This policy area contains four sites and each has a different focus. The Glenelg and Brighton Oval complexes provide for regional sporting uses, including club, spectator and social activities (and ancillary storage), as well as passive recreational opportunities.</p>	<p>Complies. The redevelopment of the Brighton Oval complex provides for enhanced regional sporting uses, including club, spectator and social activities, as well as passive recreational opportunities during times when formal games are not scheduled.</p>
<p>1. The following forms of development are envisaged in the policy area:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ car parking</li> <li>▪ clubroom associated with a sports facility</li> <li>▪ community centre</li> <li>▪ community hall</li> <li>▪ entertainment, cultural and exhibition facility</li> <li>▪ indoor and outdoor recreation facility</li> <li>▪ lighting for night use of facilities</li> </ul>	<p>Complies. The development incorporates each of these uses.</p>

## 8. Summary of Assessment

### Land Use

The proposal does not seek to change the land use of the site and reinforces the types of activity that are desired by the Development Plan. The development is consistent with Objective 1 and Principle 1 of the Community Use Zone, and the more specific Recreation Policy Area 1 which anticipate that the *“Brighton Oval complex provides for regional sporting uses, including club, spectator and social activities (and ancillary storage), as well as passive recreational opportunities.”*

Objective 1 of the Policy Area supports the type of redevelopment opportunities that are proposed here by seeking *“sporting, entertainment, cultural and recreational activities and associated spectator and administrative facilities.”* Principle 1 of the Policy area envisages car parking, clubrooms associated with a sports facility, community centres, community halls, entertainment, and indoor and outdoor recreation facilities.

The development replaces three existing sporting club buildings with three larger buildings that provide greater functionality, whilst also providing the opportunity for three visually integrated buildings. Car parking on the site will be increased, with improved circulation designed to meet current standards. Given that the land use is not changing, this assessment cannot impose restrictions on user numbers or hours of operation and the scheduling of gatherings.

### Built Form

Principle 1 in Design and Appearance seeks that the design of a building may be of a contemporary nature and exhibit an innovative style provided the overall form is sympathetic to the scale of development in the locality and with the context of its setting with regard to shape, size, materials and colour.

The proposed development, although in the form of three separate and quite detached buildings, adopts a consistent architectural theme, which assists to present the site as a single and coordinated sporting facility. The Rugby building and Lacrosse building are set close to the street frontages (Brighton Road and Hight Avenue respectively). The Lacrosse building is located in approximately the same location as the one it seeks to replace, so there is an existing built form presence in this

location, albeit single-storey compared with the proposed two-storey structure. As a counter measure, the existing Football/Cricket building located adjacent Highet Avenue will be removed and replaced with a new building located elsewhere and centrally on the site. The main 'new' visual incursion will be provided by the Rugby building, which is proposed to be transferred from its internalised location to its new highly visible location close to Brighton Road. This is partly required to rectify a longstanding problem where the current viewing facility, which forces spectators to view games against the western sun, but also to provide a physical presence at the interface with a major arterial road.

Each of the proposed buildings are quite isolated, making them visible from all sides, and from some distance. In this regard, the architecture has been careful to provide visual interest on each elevation by using a combination of materials on the front and rear facades, but also using a butterfly roof with overhangs to provide some visual interest on the side elevations.

### **Heritage Impact**

Adjoining the subject site to the north along Stopford Road is a row of sixteen Local Heritage listed Stone Pine trees. These trees are not affected by the development

### **Amenity**

Interface and Design and Appearance policies of the Development Plan ask that development '*should not affect amenity ...by the emission of ...odour...noise...light spill and hours of operation*' (Interface PDC 1), '*development adjacent to a Residential Zone should be designed to minimise ...overshadowing*' (PDC 3), '*non-residential development abutting a residential zone should be designed to minimise noise impacts and achieve adequate levels of compatibility between existing and proposed uses*' (PDC 6), '*development that emits noise should include noise attenuation measures that achieve relevant EPA noise criteria*' (PDC 7) and '*outdoor storage, loading and service areas should be screened from view by a combination of built form, solid fencing and/or landscaping, conveniently located to enable manoeuvring of service vehicles and sited away from sensitive land uses*' (Design and Appearance PDC 21).

The development does not seek to change the type of noise and activity that currently characterises the site. A noise reduction strategy undertaken by Sonus on behalf of the applicant outlines the relevant EPA and Development Plan policies that will need to be satisfied subject to a combination of measures including the provision of boundary fences, delivery procedures and restrictions in times of refuse collection and deliveries. The recommendations specifically comprise:

The representations also raised concerns around loss of privacy from the Lacrosse Building, where spectators could gather to view matches from the vantage point of the upper level balcony. The attachments to this report contain an image taken from the anticipated vantage point of the balcony associated with the Lacrosse Club. The image shows that there are no direct views to the rear yard of the residential properties located along the eastern property boundary (containing the representor's property). The Development Plan seeks that new buildings should incorporate open space and landscaping as one means to maintain privacy. Given the considerable distance between the lacrosse building and the private open space of the properties to the east (110 metres), it is considered appropriate that no physical screens (whether in the form of balcony screens or boundary fence screens) are warranted. Instead, a condition of approval will require details of further mature

vegetation to augment the existing trees along the eastern boundary that dapple views into private residences.

### **Access**

Access arrangements have been changed and improved through the proposed new development. Approximately two thirds of all the parking spaces at the Oval in the future would now be accessible only from Stopford Road (left and right turn in from Brighton Road) or via a left turn from Brighton Road (rugby field northern car park). Such traffic movement patterns would reduce the use of Highet Avenue for entry to the Oval, compared to the current situation. In this regard, the demand for the right turn in from Brighton Road into Highet Avenue would likely be reduced as a consequence. The existing access directly from Brighton Road will remain, with the addition of an access for emergency vehicles only.

DPTI advises that it is comfortable with the proposed adaptation of the existing driveway access from Brighton Road and the inclusion of a supplementary access for emergency vehicles only. DPTI has also noted their support for two thirds of car parking accessible only from Stopford Road as well as reducing the reliance on Brighton Road and Highet Avenue.

### **Traffic**

As outlined in the Traffic Report by Frank Siow commissioned by Council, the coordinated redevelopment of the site has provided the opportunity to increase car parking spaces and allow connectivity with safer traffic flows through the entire site. These measures are estimated to reduce traffic movement along Highet Avenue by making two thirds of all parking spaces accessible only from Stopford Road (left and right turn in from Brighton Road) or via a left turn from Brighton Road (rugby field northern car park). Such traffic movement patterns would heavily reduce the reliance Highet Avenue for entry to the Oval, compared to the current situation. Furthermore, the use of the existing entry from Brighton Road will provide another option for redirecting traffic away from residential streets. Although the modelling has factored a 10% increase in traffic generated, the provision of greater parking, improved circulation, and restricted access are all expected to improve traffic and parking conditions (even if participation numbers increase by more than 10%).

### **Parking**

The development proposes a new car park layout with increased number of spaces. Additional parking provision would satisfactorily cater for the future parking demands of the overall site, with the proposed 344 spaces significantly exceeding usage requirements and Development Plan quantitative standards. Council's traffic engineer suggests that the future parking provision of 344 spaces would cater for an equivalent scenario of a 30% increase in usage at the oval, meaning the parking provision would be able to satisfy the likely future peak parking demands at the Oval.

Council's traffic engineer suggests that although the proposed parking layouts seems to comply with relevant Australian Standards, some adjustments to the design is recommended, which would enable more parking to be accommodated on-site and to provide better circulation around the various parking areas. Council will continue to work with its own engineers to seek further opportunities for efficiencies within the car park, notwithstanding that minimum requirements have been exceeded.

## Conclusion

The development is largely consistent with Council's Development Plan, particularly in regard to the Community Zone and Recreation Policy Area 1 criteria. Having regard to compliance with most provisions of the Development Plan and the anticipated scale of development within the Community Zone it is considered that the development will sit comfortably within the locality, and really amounts to a reasonable upgrade of the existing land use to ensure that the facility responds to contemporary needs of the community. The development application has provided an opportunity to improve parking opportunities within the site and traffic circulation within the surrounding streets. Overall, the proposal represents a coordinated development of a sporting precinct, providing attractive facilities to ensure the long-term future for the Clubs and their members.

## 9. RECOMMENDATION

1. **The proposed development is NOT seriously at variance with the policies in the Development Plan.**
2. **Following a detailed assessment of the proposal against the Holdfast Bay (City) Development Plan, the Council Assessment Panel resolves to grant Development Plan Consent to Development Application 110/00502/18 the demolition of three existing sporting clubrooms and their replacement with three, two-storey sporting clubrooms, and the removal of one Regulated tree, subject to the following conditions:**

### PLANNING CONDITIONS

1. **That the development shall be implemented in accordance with the plans and documentation submitted to and approved by Council unless varied by any subsequent conditions imposed herein.**
2. **That the premises shall be maintained, kept tidy, free of graffiti and in good repair and condition to the reasonable satisfaction of Council at all times.**
3. **That the premises shall not be used, directly or indirectly, for the purpose now approved until all work has been completed in accordance with the plan approved and the conditions of consent have been complied with, except those conditions that continue to apply.**
4. **That a detailed landscape plan shall be provided to Council for further assessment prior to the issue of Development Approval, including details of any screen planting along the eastern property boundary. Nominated vegetation species shall comprise where practicable, trees and shrubs that are indigenous to the local area and are semi mature or of fast growing tubestock. All such landscaping shall be established within 3 months of substantial completion of the development and any such vegetation shall be replaced if and when it dies or becomes seriously diseased.**
5. **Any change in levels along external site boundaries of 200mm or more shall be retained to suitable engineering standards and any fencing shall be erected on top of such retaining walls. Construction of all retaining walls shall be undertaken and completed prior to the commencement of construction of the dwelling(s) herein approved.**

6. That access by patrons to the outside, upstairs balconies associated with each of the three clubroom buildings shall be closed each night from 10pm to 8am the following day. The balconies can be accessed at all times for cleaning and maintenance purposes.
7. Waste collection areas and bins shall be secured and screened from public view. Details of screens for waste storage areas shall be provided to Council prior to the issue of Development Approval. The screens shall, where practicable, be designed in coordination with the architecture, materials and colours of the main buildings they serve.
8. That tree protection measures shall be installed around the trunks of each tree on site and street tree affected by the construction work. Details of tree protection measures shall be provided to Council prior to the issue of Development Approval and installed prior to the commencement of any construction on the site.
9. That details of air conditioning plant, appropriate acoustic screening and advice from an acoustic engineer regarding compliance with relevant EPA policies be submitted to Council prior to Development Approval.
10. That all waste collection be restricted to 9am-7pm Sunday and Public Holidays and 7am-7pm on other days.
11. Noise attenuation measures shall be incorporated in the structural make-up of each building as a means to suppress internal noise affecting the amenity of adjacent residential areas, and to also suppress traffic noise (from Brighton Road in particular) from reducing the amenity of patrons within the buildings (particularly the Rugby building). That details of such structural noise attenuation measures, including glazing, and as outlined in the Sonus report dated July 2018, shall be provided to Council for assessment prior to the issue of Building Rules Consent. All approved noise attenuation measures shall be integrated within each building prior to their occupation.
12. That construction shall take place between 7am and 7pm Monday to Saturday and not on Sundays or public holidays. All such work shall be undertaken in such a manner so as not to, in the reasonable opinion of Council, cause any nuisance or annoyance to any of the occupiers of buildings within the locality. Any work outside of these hours requires the written approval of Council.
13. That dust emissions from the site shall be controlled by a dust suppressant or by watering (subject to any relevant water restrictions) regularly to the reasonable satisfaction of Council.
14. That the builder shall at all times provide and maintain a waste receptacle to the reasonable satisfaction of Council on the site in which and at all times all builder's waste shall be contained for the duration of the construction period and the receptacle shall be emptied as required.
15. That all hard building materials, waste and litter on site be stored in a manner that secures it on site during the construction works.
16. That no solid or liquid trade wastes be discharged to the stormwater system.

17. **Appropriate signage and line marking shall be utilised to reinforce the desired flow of traffic to, from and through the site.**
18. **All service vehicle movements associated with the development shall be undertaken outside of peak traffic hours on the adjacent roads and peak times of site operation.**
19. **All car parking and internal manoeuvring areas shall be in accordance with AS/NZS 2890.1:2004 and 2890.6:2009.**
20. **All commercial vehicle facilities shall be designed in accordance with AS 2890.2–2002.**
21. **All materials and finishes shall not be permitted to result in glare or other effects that will result in the discomfort or impairment of road users.**
22. **Signage on this site that is viewable from the adjacent or nearby roads shall not utilise any element of LED/LCD display (the use of LED lighting for the internal illumination of a sign box is permissible).**
23. **Signage on this site shall not contain any element that flashes, scrolls, moves or changes.**
24. **Illuminated signage on this site shall be limited to a low level of illumination (5200cd/m<sup>2</sup>) so as to minimise distraction to motorists.**
25. **Non-illuminated signage on this site shall be finished in a material of low reflectivity to minimise the risk of sun/headlamp glare that may dazzle or distract motorists.**
26. **The utilisation of Trailer Mounted Variable Message Displays for advertising purposes shall not occur on or adjacent to the subject land.**
27. **Stormwater run-off shall be collected on-site and discharged without jeopardising the safety and integrity of the adjoining arterial road. Any alterations to road drainage infrastructure required to accommodate the development shall be at the expense of the applicant.**

#### **DPTI Conditions**

28. **All vehicles shall enter and exit the site in a forward direction**
29. **The access points to Brighton Road shall be designed in general accordance with the Tonkin Consulting Concept Plan, Drawing 20180691, Sheet 01, Revision C, dated 9 August 2018.**
30. **The northern Brighton Road access point shall be designed and suitably flared to accommodate two-way vehicle movements of a B99 vehicle (as per AS/NZS 2890.1:2004).**
31. **The southern Brighton Road access point (located opposite Preston Avenue) shall be limited to emergency use and maintenance (rubbish removal). Access by other vehicles shall be prohibited and movements shall be limited to left turn in and left turn out. This access shall be designed and signed for left turn in and left turn out movements and incorporate a 'No entry – authorised vehicles only' sign.**

32. All off-street parking shall be designed in accordance with *AS/NZS 2890.1:2004* and *AS/NZS 2890.6:2009*. Additionally, clear sightlines, as shown in Figure 3.3 'Minimum Sight Lines for Pedestrian Safety' in *AS/NZS 2890.1:2004*, shall be provided at the property line to ensure adequate visibility between vehicles leaving the site and pedestrians on the adjacent footpath.
33. Stormwater run-off shall be collected on-site and disposed of safely without jeopardising the safety of the adjacent roads. Any alterations to the existing road drainage infrastructure as a result of this development shall be at the expense of the applicant.

**NOTES:**

1. Additional landowner approval and development consent is required for any regulated signs and advertising located either as standalone items or attached to the approved buildings.
2. This development authorisation does not include an assessment or approval for any freestanding scoreboard(s). Further development application is required for the installation of freestanding scoreboards.